

# ***Solidarity Beyond the Nation State***

## ***Diversity, Solidarity and Redistribution***

**Keith Banting**

Responding to Complex Diversity: Europe and Canada  
RECODE / Canada-Europe Transatlantic Dialogue  
Université de Montréal,  
12-13 September 2013

# My agenda

- Two underlying questions
  - Is there a tension between diversity and social solidarity?
  - Do the policies deployed by the state matter?
- Conclusions
  - In search of broader frameworks

# PART ONE

---

## Migration, Ethnic Diversity and Redistribution

# The arguments and the evidence

- The basic arguments
  - Crowding out / corroding / collateral damage
- US evidence
  - Politics of race: Quadagno; Gilens; Putnam; Alesina
  - US-Europe comparison: Freeman; Alesina and Glaesar
- Canadian evidence
  - Trust, neighbourhood, national identity: Soroka et al
- European evidence
  - Senik at al; Finseraas; van Oorshot
  - Scandinavia: Gerdes-Wadensjö; Brochmann; Koning

# Emerging patterns?

- Evidence is mixed
- Impacts generally small?
- Context matters
- Rates of change and tipping points
- Cultural anxieties trump economic anxieties
- Europe vs US: adjusting as mature welfare states
- Retrenchment vs welfare chauvinism
- Politics of framing: elites/parties/media

# Implications

- Implications for the study of the welfare state
  - Are the effects small? If so, what then?
  - Where does diversity sit in a list of the factors shaping the welfare state?
  - Why has diversity emerged so forcefully in last decade?
- Need to integrate ethnic diversity into broader frameworks?
  - See diversity as part of the larger combination of factors at work

# Part Two

---

Role of state policies

# Role of state policies

- Do state choices matter?
  - Does state's approach mitigate or worsen tensions
  - Tendency to analyze one policy at a time
- Welfare state regime
  - Debate over implications of welfare state regime
- Diversity policy
  - Debate over multiculturalism policies
- Need to analyze policy packages
  - Need for a more comprehensive framework



# Welfare state regime

- Distinctive vulnerabilities?
  - Liberal welfare states
    - Selective programs more vulnerable to political backlash
  - Conservative welfare states
    - Interaction with insider-outsider divide
  - Social democratic welfare states
    - Interaction with regulation of low-wage sector

# Diversity policy

- Critiques of multiculturalism policies
  - Academic critique: Barry, Goodhart
  - Political backlash: Merkel, Cameron
    - Multiculturalism → segregation and poor social outcomes
    - Sharp turn to civic integration
- Empirical findings
  - No evidence that MCPs weaken welfare state
    - Banting and Kymlicka 2006; Kesler and Bloemraad 2010; Wright and Bloemraad 2012; Hooghe, Reeskens and Stolle 2007.
  - No general retreat from MCPs: Banting- Kymlicka; Koopmans
  - Layering of civic integration over previous MCPs
    - Different combinations emerging in European countries

# Toward a comprehensive view integration policy regimes

- Integration regimes
  - Freeman: complex, weakly coordinated
- Component systems
  - Migration policies (composition of migrant flow)
  - Integration policies (civic integration)
  - Diversity policies (multiculturalism policies)
  - Naturalization policies
  - Welfare state

# Analyzing policy packages

- Diversity policies and welfare state regime
  - Koopmans: combines diversity policy and welfare state
  - Problem: nature of migration policies / migrant groups
- Research agenda
  - Implications of different packages for
    - socio-economic integration
    - public support for social programs
    - Different welfare state regimes

# Part Three: Conclusions

- Conclusions
  - Major expansion of knowledge in this field
  - Migration, ethnic diversity and redistribution
    - Small effects?
    - Need to broaden the frame of reference?
  - Role of state policy approaches
    - Problem of studying separate policies in isolation
    - Need to analyze policy as well as discourse
    - Need for more comprehensive frameworks